

1. Staff participating in any test period should have their consent limited to that period. Fresh consent should be sought at the time of any eventual rollout of the system for all staff so as to ensure they are not disadvantaged by any changes that occur (such as the clocking in / out with biometric data or staff ID number).

Response: Needs IR view around consent.

In circumstances where the direction to staff to engage the Kronos clock to meet wage compliance, and Calvary have provided;

- a full explanation of how the system works,
- what data is required together with options (biometric finger print or employee number),
- what the data is used for,
- what the data is not used for, and
- how the data is being stored,

why is there a requirement to obtain additional consent beyond implied consent through either use of the biometric fingerprint or the input of the employee number?

To help us understand the basis of your question, please provide your written reasons prior to 12 January 2023.

2. We request a full report of all issues identified in any trial period conducted between now and the next meeting on 12 January 2023.

Response: we expect that the results will be incomplete and, representing a first round of testing, not provide meaningful information outside of the build and test team. The nature of these projects is that test is done to find errors, that we expect to find errors and that the testing will allow us to correct them in advance.

3. There is a significant change in the flexibility afforded to managers and staff in attendance times and the completion of timesheets. The Kronos bundy clock system will interfere with this. A bundy clock system is usually used in factory or similar settings – not with professionals in a hospital. The loss of this flexibility, and the apparent lack of trust demonstrated by requiring use of a bundy clock like system, is likely to have long term negative impacts on the relationship between Calvary and its employees. If the system must be used, efficient, practical work arounds must be found prior to the system's implementation.

Response: Calvary, alongside many health care providers in Australia, uses biometric clocks as the default means to capture start and stop times. We, as do other health providers and UKG (Kronos vendor), understand that flexibility is a requirement for our teams. We support flexibility and will train managers how this will be managed in the system. With clocks in place at multiple Calvary facilities across Australia, we do not find a correlation between their installation and engagement of the staff.

To help us understand the basis of your question better, please identify precisely what you mean by "there is a significant change in the flexibility afforded to managers and staff in attendance times and the completion of timesheets". The accurate measure of employee's attendance at work is critical for a number of reasons, not the least of which include accurate payment of wages and integrity of time and attendance data. Wage theft

legislation is shortly to be introduced that makes non-payment of wages an unlawful act and subject to prosecution.

A Kronos clock system is one of the most accurate means of ensuring that live data is available to accurately meet those obligations. In every sense and in light of those legislative requirements the direction to staff to use the Kronos clock with alternative means of data entry is reasonable. As indicated previously it is used generally in the health industry, and in a variety of Calvary Aged Care facilities and Hospitals. This is not a new concept.

In light of the respective legislative requirements Calvary face and what it considers reasonable steps to meet those obligations, we ask that the HSU and ANMF provide in writing prior to 12 January next the following:

- 1. Acknowledgement that Calvary must comply with new wage theft legislation,**
- 2. Agreement that when describing the “flexible” arrangements as to when employees may or may not be on site that that a clock on and off system is the an accurate means to capture live data as to when those employees are working and on shift, and**
- 3. Confirmation that the HSU and ANMF will be advising staff that use of the Kronos clock as an accurate capture of attendance on site is a reasonable management direction and with the options provided regarding data entry one that HSU and ANMF members must follow.**

We also reject entirely that any flexibility in the work place ceases with the introduction of Kronos clock system. Flexibility as is well known to both the HSU and ANMF is a creature of the Fair Work Act and able to be exercised by mutual agreement between employees and management at any time. Similarly, enterprise agreements are written with flexibility to extend meal breaks or adjust work times to allow for the type of flexibility we assume you are suggesting exists.

Please explain in writing prior to 12 January 2024 how any of that changes and where the inability of an employee to ask their manager to have an extended lunch, leave early, start late etc. is jeopardised by the introduction of a Kronos clock that accurately reflects those agreed flexible arrangements?

- 4. The workloads of managers are likely to significantly increase, particularly in the short term as a new system is learnt, but also long term as many more active steps will be required to adjust the automatically generated timesheets will be required. Efficient and practical processes must be found prior to the system’s implementation. Or, if that is not possible, sufficient staffing resources should be put in place to deal with the additional workload both short and long term.**

Response: All change comes with a transition where there is time required to learn the new system and embed processes. Calvary will provide change management support to managers for this process. We expect that this will change the balance of tasks that managers do. This will not be quantifiable without the detailed, individual service consultation that will occur to review all rosters and rostering processes in Calvary Mater Newcastle (CMN) . What has been learnt from implementing the clocks in other Calvary facilities is, the payroll practice will ultimately change for the Manager, from manual

signing and handling of paper timesheets to managing the workflow on a daily basis electronically.

5. One alternative to biometric data has been offered: keying in the individual's ID number. In the meeting on 6 December 2023, it became apparent that a swipe card may be able to be set up for use which is likely to be more efficient than payroll number entry. We request that Calvary to explain why a swipe card cannot be implemented. We request that a key card is offered as an alternative to both biometric data and ID number sign in.

Response: We agree there are multiple means for clocking into a site and the expectation is that these will be explored once CMN is on the national payroll system (including national processes) and we are in a position to then plan the upgrades required to enable different sign-in processes. Swipe-card is not available within the current payroll build at any Calvary facility.

6. Not all functionality of Kronos through the Calvary app will be made available initially. Please explain the functions of Kronos that will be available through the app and by what date each function is expected to be available. Please also explain why all functions cannot be made available prior to commencement of the system.

Effective from the go live of the Kronos upgrade, CMN employees will be able to view the following on the My Calvary App:

- View payslips (current feature in place);
- View their roster;
- Accept vacant shifts; and
- **View** their timecard.

Response: MC to

The MyCalvary app is only linked to our production environment and must be completed in stages. Once the complete build of workload planners/rosters and schedules are set up and the test of rules is complete, a transfer of the Mater staff will be loaded into our Production environment ready for go live. Once this is completed all functionality of the app including timecards will be available

7. It has been established that employees will not be able to access or check their timesheets after amendments are made by their manager. Employees must be able to access their amended payslips prior to receiving payment to ensure pay accuracy and to ensure all requests have been actioned by managers.

Response: MC to provide Once CMN go live, employees will have access to view their rosters, payslips and timesheets via the app. Staff will not have the option to amend their own time sheets, they will need to take this up with the manager

8. There are a limited number of access points available. How will the large influx of staff at starting times be dealt with? Are staff expected to attend work prior to their start time to clock in?

There are 17 clocks installed across the Hospital campus. The clock locations were carefully placed at entry and exit points to enable staff accessibility. Through the consultation which has already occurred, it has been identified two additional clocks will be required. The

acquisition of these clocks has commenced. Once the additional locations have been confirmed, employees will be notified and the heat map will be updated accordingly.

9. Calvary has relied on WHS issues in part to justify implementation of the system. How will Kronos reflect whether a person is on or off site after clocking in at Calvary at the start of their shift (for e.g. staff that work both in the hospital and at patient's homes or other sites on a single day)? How will Kronos account for non-Calvary staff on site (i.e. HNELHD and any other private employees)?

Response: Calvary's primary motivators for migrating to the national payroll system are threefold: alignment with national processes and systems in order to allow the whole company to move forward, pay safety by ensuring real-time clocking and cyber safety by ensuring our systems are maintained to appropriate technical standards in line with vendor recommendations

With the 'Exceptions' and 'notifications' within Kronos, managers are easily able to see employee's that have either missed punches (due to forgetfulness or off-site duties. They are easily able to enter these in themselves. There are also future technologies that we will be looking to introduce, including but not limited to, Mobile App punching (both geo-location based and Wireless network based).

WHS is a secondary benefit whereby there is an additional data point to be used in investigations if required. Workers from other sites would be protected using existing protocols.

10. Data safety is a significant concern. Many large and IT savvy organisations have recently suffered significant data breaches. Has Kronos ever had any data breach issues? What were they? How were they resolved?

Response: Much like the current Mater instance of Kronos (product name is UKG Workforce Central, or WFC) the National Instance is hosted On-Premise and has no known data breaches. There has also not been any known data breaches for WFC for other companies while they are operated On Premise.

11. Has Calvary had any data safety issues with its current system? Have any breaches occurred? How were they resolved?

Response: The current system places Kronos at heightened risk of cyber threat. This information will not be shared but no breaches of the Mater Kronos have occurred to date.

The data inside of Kronos itself is very secure and we review/update regularly (i.e. won't be able to 'hack' the server or database). Unless someone managed break into an employee's user account, who happened to have full system access, has a Kronos manager licence with the correct level of access, their ability to be a threat is very minimal.

12. The physical removal of payroll from the site will cause communication issues between staff and payroll. Being able to physically go to payroll is far more effective than phone or email for many people. How will this be managed? Will staff be able to attend the new site if required?

Response: That is an assumption based on current system configuration and practices which will change. For the transition period, Calvary will maintain a payroll staff presence on site until September 2024 and assess way forward at that point, based on how the support team is engaged. The payroll team will be on a different ICT platform which will be easier to use in the Calvary office at Warabrook which is a five minute car ride to the Mater, should urgent site support be required.

Whilst the payroll team will eventually transition offsite, you can be assured the service and advice they provide to staff will continue.

13. The State award system and associated enterprise agreements are complex and difficult to apply. Will there be consistency in staffing? Will payroll be expected to undertake other work, reducing their capacity to deal with the unique issues at Calvary Mater Newcastle?

Response: The payroll team's transition to the National structures provides stability and consistency of staff responding to CMN enquiries. The CMN payroll team will be assigned all CMN enquiries as part of the transition to ensure continuity.

Calvary already interprets and maintains multi-enterprise agreements associated with Affiliated Health Organisations (AHO) for our Hospital in Kogarah. The nature of the Payroll team's work will change to have less manual processing as a result of the upgrade and they will be allocated additional duties in time to make up for that change in work practice.

14. With many individuals using the same touch screen over a very short period of time, how will hygiene be maintained (particularly for any staff who may be immunocompromised)?

Response: Similar to computer keyboards and door handles, Calvary Mater will be expected to maintain existing infection control standards with the clocks as well. Each clock has a sanitising station in close proximity to ensure infection control is complied with.

15. Some of the Kronos boxes have been placed in patient throughput or care areas which may negatively impact their experience. It may also cause bottle necks and limit the access of emergency teams like MET. Placements should be reviewed and moved.

Response: This is being reviewed on an individual basis in consultation with the appropriate Department Managers. Some clocks will be moved as a result.

16. At times, where staff are held up clocking in to work, the commencement of provision of service may be delayed and will reduce productivity. This will in turn reduce the ability to complete all patient related services. For example, if clocking in time is 8am and the first patient time is 8am, there will be delays in commencing patient care. A similar situation may occur at the end of the day.

Response: This is a system used in multiple private hospitals, both Calvary's and competitors, across Australia. Further to this, the process works well in Calvary's other AHO Hospital at Kogarah. We do not see a major productivity lag arising from this at other sites and expect the same for CMN.

17. Staff request confirmation that future Kronos implementation (Dimensions) has the ability for staff to sign in/out and adjust their timesheets through the app, negating the need to bundy clock on and off at a machine.

Response: This is an available feature in the Dimensions suite which the Payroll team would like to implement and will be considered as a part of the business case for that project.

18. If the system is implemented, Calvary should seek consent in writing (as opposed to any implied consent).

In circumstances where the direction to staff to engage the Kronos clock to meet wage compliance is reasonable, and

- a full explanation of how the system works has been provided,
- what data is required (biometric finger print or employee number),
- what the data is used for,
- what the data is not used for, and
- how the data is being stored,

why is there a requirement to obtain additional consent beyond implied consent through either use of the biometric fingerprint or the input of the employee number?

To help us understand the basis of your question, please provide your written reasons prior to 12 January 2023.

19. We require a more detailed explanation of Calvary's statement that it will be "beneficial to reflect once again on the importance of real time data regarding employees' attendance on site".

Response: We expect there will be greater transparency for staff and managers around time and attendance at CMN. It will make it easier for staff instead of remembering when they started and finished each shift and managers will have a better understanding of what is happening in their service. As previously stated, this does not prevent flexible work practices from being applied.

In addition we draw your attention to the responses previously provided which all answer similar versions of this question.